Representative Article Critique

Education 637

Assignment:

The purpose of this assignment is to discuss a piece of scholarly work, typically a peer-reviewed journal article, that is a model of the best work in the field that has high relevance to your paper. This work should be drawn from your reference list (i.e., it makes no sense that the best and most relevant article you have to share would not be important enough to cite in your paper). Your discussion should:

- a) Demonstrate your ability to accurately summarize a piece of scholarly writing;
- b) Evaluate the technical quality and specific value of this work; and
- c) Identify how your paper (or proposal) is related to this work through specific comparisons and contrasts.

How to meet the three (a-c) discussion requirements:

To demonstrate your ability to accurately summarize your chosen scholarly work, you should be able to write a structured abstract to represent its content (see example available through the External Links area on the course Blackboard site).

Your evaluation of the technical quality and specific value of your chosen scholarly work should include, to the best of your ability, (i) a very brief discussion about whether the study design, data collection, and analysis strategies were appropriate and well executed and (ii) an assessment of why this reference is of high importance to your own paper.

Identifying the relationship between your chosen scholarly work and your own paper should include (i) statements about how what you are doing is like or differs from this reference work, (ii) in what way you and the reference author(s) have theoretically or conceptually framed your respective studies similarly (or differently), and (iii) whether you are writing to the same audience as that to which the reference author(s) was(were) writing.

Expectations of your presentation:

Your presentation should take about four to six (4-6) minutes, but absolutely no more than six minutes. You are not expected to fully retell the reference work but to make the link between it and your work. (Note on time: if you were to read your structured abstract aloud, it should take about two minutes.)

You should have handouts, PowerPoint slides (up to 6), a poster, or make use of the chalkboard to assist your audience in following your presentation (*just one* of these four strategies is all that is necessary). Failure to do so will not be penalized but may indirectly affect the quality of your brief presentation.

Do not distribute abstracts, a written paper, or other lengthy materials. Do not have long and wordy PowerPoint slides, or otherwise attempt to put all or most of what you have to say on what you display for the class.

If it helps, you may read from prepared remarks. That is, you may read from your structured abstract and anything else you write in preparation for your presentation.